

## DOCTORAL THESIS

### The doubting dean Jonathan Swift's Critique of reason in the age of enlightenment

He, Xiyao

*Date of Award:*  
2016

[Link to publication](#)

#### **General rights**

Copyright and intellectual property rights for the publications made accessible in HKBU Scholars are retained by the authors and/or other copyright owners. In addition to the restrictions prescribed by the Copyright Ordinance of Hong Kong, all users and readers must also observe the following terms of use:

- Users may download and print one copy of any publication from HKBU Scholars for the purpose of private study or research
- Users cannot further distribute the material or use it for any profit-making activity or commercial gain
- To share publications in HKBU Scholars with others, users are welcome to freely distribute the permanent URL assigned to the publication

## Abstract

By drawing on the two waves of critique of the Enlightenment and its version of reason—one after the French Revolution and the other after WWII—this research pushes the timeline to an even earlier point and tries to study the critique of the Enlightenment and its version of reason within the Enlightenment itself. In doing so it chooses the English/Irish writer Jonathan Swift for case study, because in his works he repeatedly levels scathing criticisms of his age and the reason upheld by many of his contemporaries.

In his critique of the Enlightenment and its version of reason Swift appeals to a long tradition in Western intellectual history which regards human reason as twofold: a discursive part which proceeds in a step-by-step manner, through analysis, calculation, and demonstration; and an intuitive part which reaches the conclusion directly, immediately, and with much certainty. The Enlightenment, however, breaks the balance between the two by promoting discursive reason and eliminating intuitive reason. As a result, discursive reason is easily instrumentalized without the check of intuitive reason, which is thrown into oblivion.

Swift's critique is essentially a protest against this trend that was going on at his time. In contrast to it, he denounces discursive reason while champions intuitive reason. In his critique, the main target is discursive reason, and it necessarily also involves the most representative embodiment of discursive reason that was prospering at the time, namely, natural science. The critique of discursive reason and of science is made partly by relying on intuitive reason, which makes it, in a sense, also reason's critique of itself.

Of course, Swift does not regard human reason, either intuitive or discursive, as the panacea for human beings. As a priest of the Anglican Church, he thinks reason should always be subordinate to faith—in other words, reason is limited. But perhaps ironically, in his emphasis on the limit of reason and the consequent need for faith as embodied and ensured in an authoritative institution, Swift reveals his own bigotry, intolerance and authoritarianism, which shows how he was historically and ideologically limited.

Despite his historical and ideological limit, Swift's critique of reason is still of relevance and value to us today. As a Counter-Enlightenment thinker within the Enlightenment, he exposes for us another aspect of reason which is usually ignored today, and consequently helps to deepen our understanding not only of the Enlightenment, but also of enlightenment itself and the contemporary world we are still living in.

## Table of Contents

<b>Declaration.....</b>	<b>i</b>
<b>Abstract.....</b>	<b>ii</b>
<b>Acknowledgements.....</b>	<b>iii</b>
<b>Table of Contents.....</b>	<b>v</b>
<b>List of Figures.....</b>	<b>viii</b>
<b>Abbreviations.....</b>	<b>ix</b>
<b>Chapter One Introduction.....</b>	<b>1</b>
1.1 Subject of Research.....	1
1.2 Research Questions and Methodology.....	9
1.3 Research Background.....	10
1.3.1 Swift’s View on Reason as Unitary.....	12
1.3.2 Swift’s View on Reason as Binary.....	13
1.3.3 Swift’s View on Reason as Tripartite.....	15
1.4 Chapter Outline.....	17
<b>Chapter Two Clarification of Important Terms.....</b>	<b>19</b>
2.1 The Enlightenment.....	20
2.1.1 Capitalized vs. in Lower Case.....	20
2.1.2 Singular or Plural.....	22
2.1.3 The Opposite Side.....	26
2.2 Reason.....	28
2.2.1 Reason as Unified.....	28
2.2.2 Reason as Divided.....	29
2.3 Critique.....	33
2.3.1 What Is Critique?.....	34
2.3.2 Critique, the Enlightenment, and Modernity.....	37
2.3.3 Immanent Critique vs. External Critique.....	39
<b>Chapter Three A Brief History of Reason before Swift.....</b>	<b>42</b>
3.1 In Classical Philosophy.....	42
3.1.1 Reason as Logos.....	42
3.1.2 Plato’s Categorization of Human Reason.....	44
3.1.3 Aristotle’s Categorization of Human Reason.....	48
3.2 In Christian Philosophy during the Middle Ages.....	51
3.2.1 Augustine’s Distinction between Reason and Reasoning.....	51
3.2.2 Aquinas’s Rejection of Intuitive Reason.....	53
3.3 In Philosophy and Literature of the Seventeenth Century.....	55
3.3.1 Descartes on Intuition as Proceeding from the Light of Reason.....	55
3.3.2 Milton on Intuitive Reason.....	56

3.3.3 Spinoza on Intuition as a Distinct Faculty Superior to Reason.....	58
3.3.4 Locke on Reason as Purely Discursive.....	60
3.4 The General Trend.....	62
<b>Chapter Four Swift’s Categorization, View, and Critique of Reason.....</b>	<b>67</b>
4.1 Swift’s Categorization of Reason.....	67
4.2 Three Points of Clarification.....	79
4.3 <i>Animal Rationis Capax</i> .....	81
4.4 Intuitive Reason and Discursive Reason in Swift.....	88
4.4.1 Intuitive Reason and Discursive Reason in <i>Gulliver’s Travels</i> .....	90
4.4.1.1 The Houyhnhnms as Embodiment of Intuitive Reason.....	90
4.4.1.2 The Philosophers of Laputa as Embodiment of Discursive Reason.....	99
4.4.2 Further Analysis of Section IX of <i>A Tale of a Tub</i> .....	109
<b>Chapter Five Swift’s “Grotesque” Critique of Science Based on His</b>	
<b>Metaphorical Understanding of Nature as Woman.....</b>	<b>121</b>
5.1 “Hatred of Bowels”.....	123
5.2 “The Progress of Beauty”.....	127
5.3 Swift’s Attitude toward Women.....	132
5.3.1 The Scatological Poems.....	132
5.3.2 The Attitude Revealed in “The Lady’s Dressing Room”.....	136
5.3.3 The Attitude Revealed in “Strephon and Chloe”.....	138
5.4 Swift’s View on Nature and Critique of Science.....	144
5.4.1 The Traditional View of Nature as Female in the West.....	145
5.4.1.1 Nature as Essentially Ugly and Destructive.....	146
5.4.1.2 “The Death of Nature”.....	147
5.4.2 Swift’s Critique of Science.....	150
5.4.2.1 Studies on Swift’s Critique of Science.....	150
5.4.2.2 My “Grotesque” Approach.....	153
5.4.2.3 Swift’s Disruption of the Sexist Binary Opposition.....	155
5.4.2.4 As in Woman, as in Nature.....	158
5.4.2.5 Swift’s “Grotesque” Critique of Science.....	160
<b>Chapter Six The Limit of Reason and the Limit of Swift.....</b>	<b>167</b>
6.1 Contextualizing Swift’s Participation in the Theological Debates.....	167
6.1.1 Three Views on the Relationship between Reason and Faith at the Time.....	168
6.1.2 Doubts about Swift’s Faith despite His Defense of the Anglican Church.....	170
6.2 The Limit of Reason and the Consequent Necessity of Faith.....	172
6.2.1 Relationship between Discursive Reason and Ethical Doctrines.....	174
6.2.2 Relationship between Intuitive Reason and Ethical Doctrines.....	175
6.2.3 Relationship between Discursive Reason and Mysteries.....	176
6.2.4 Relationship between Intuitive Reason and Mysteries.....	177
6.3 The Self-Contradiction and Limit of Swift.....	178
6.3.1 The Way to Deal with Doubts.....	179
6.3.2 The Choice out of and Adjustment of the Relationship between Multiple	

Faiths.....	181
6.3.3 Swift's Self-Contradictory Take on Liberty.....	185
6.3.4 The Limit of Swift.....	188
<b>Chapter Seven Conclusion.....</b>	<b>194</b>
<b>Works Cited.....</b>	<b>199</b>
<b>CURRICULUM VITAE.....</b>	<b>218</b>