

DOCTORAL THESIS

An analysis of Pakistan's foreign policy towards Peoples Republic of China: a strengthening alignment (2005 onwards)

Hassan, Syeda Kanwal

Date of Award:
2019

[Link to publication](#)

General rights

Copyright and intellectual property rights for the publications made accessible in HKBU Scholars are retained by the authors and/or other copyright owners. In addition to the restrictions prescribed by the Copyright Ordinance of Hong Kong, all users and readers must also observe the following terms of use:

- Users may download and print one copy of any publication from HKBU Scholars for the purpose of private study or research
- Users cannot further distribute the material or use it for any profit-making activity or commercial gain
- To share publications in HKBU Scholars with others, users are welcome to freely distribute the permanent URL assigned to the publication

ABSTRACT

The problem driving this research stems from the lack of a systematic and theoretically, informed framework to identify the dynamics of Pakistan's strengthening alignment with China. Pakistan developed close defence and strategic ties with China during the Cold War period as both states balanced against a common adversary i.e. India.

However, Pakistan has attempted to bolster and expand its' links with China in the aftermath of U.S. military presence in Afghanistan due to a host of regional and global developments that widened the cracks and increased the mistrust that has existed between Pakistan and U.S. This study hypothesises that Pakistan has maintained a policy of alignment with China prior to 2005 however; from 2005 onwards, Pakistan has attempted to diversify its scope of relations with China as in response to external changes and circumstances in the geopolitical and geo-economic sphere.

Therefore, the objective of this research is to analyse why Pakistan has attempted to strengthen its' alignment towards China from 2005 onwards.

The existing literature on the subject is outdated, rigorously descriptive and is void of conceptual connections. To address these gaps; this research adopts a theoretical framework of analysis that is informed by neoclassical realist theory of foreign policy analysis to help analyse Pakistan's China policy. This framework offers a two-level analysis of Pakistan's behaviour. The independent variable is the set of system-level drivers such as international power relations, external threat perceptions and international economic interdependencies. The intervening variable, which affects the way Pakistan's decision-makers perceive the system-level developments, is the strategic culture at the unit level.

This study suggests that the principle driver of Pakistan's accelerated alignment policy towards China during this period is Pakistan's perceptions of international systemic/structure drivers, which are; the external developments that have occurred in its region. In addition, how Pakistan perceives those external developments is determined by its' strategic culture; which an intervening role. The strategic culture, the author argues, is dominated by Pakistan's distrust of India and, it narrowly confines the idea of Pakistan's national interest to military security whilst neglecting the economic aspect of it. The thesis finds that Pakistan has actively tried to cultivate a

broader and robust relationship with China to limit its' dependency on U.S. for strategic, economic and diplomatic support.

Pakistan has become increasingly sceptic of the U.S. for its carrots-and-stick approach towards Pakistan. Whereas China has enabled Pakistan to continue in its' revisionist agendas which to some extent are tolerable for China. It finds that growth in China's economic and military power has provided Pakistan with an alternate patron from whom it can procure weapons, conventional and non-conventional and it can seek financial support. This study also finds that although there is evidence of a deeper relationship beyond the traditional security-centric one, however; it is developing into more of a client-patron relationship, given, that Pakistan is increasingly becoming a country highly indebted to China.

Keywords: Pakistan, China, foreign policy analysis, alignment, neoclassical realism

Contents

| | |
|--|-----------|
| DECLARATION | i |
| ABSTRACT..... | ii |
| ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS | iv |
| ABBREVIATION | vi |
| Contents | x |
| Chapter 1: Introduction | 1 |
| Scope and Time span of the Research | 7 |
| Research Methodology..... | 9 |
| Hypothesis | 9 |
| Research Objectives and Design | 9 |
| Structure of the study..... | 13 |
| Literature Review..... | 18 |
| Existing literature on Pakistan’s relations with China | 18 |
| Academia and the Pakistani State..... | 29 |
| Conclusion..... | 33 |
| Chapter 2: Theoretical Framework: Neoclassical Realism and Alignment..... | 35 |
| Introduction | 35 |
| Liberal and Constructivist approaches to foreign policy analysis..... | 35 |
| Why Neoclassical Realism? And not Neorealism..... | 42 |
| Operationalization of Neoclassical Realism on Pakistan Foreign Policy Analysis | 50 |
| Variables..... | 53 |
| Independent Variable..... | 53 |
| Systemic Stimuli/ External Environment: System Structure and Structural Modifiers | 54 |
| Intervening Variable | 61 |
| Literature on Pakistan’s Strategic Culture..... | 66 |
| Key Elements and features of Pakistan’s Strategic Culture | 71 |
| Dependent Variable | 76 |
| Linking IV and IVV with DV | 81 |
| Chapter 3: Pakistan’s Domestic Politics | 85 |
| Preliminary Rule 1947- 1958 | 85 |
| First Military Rule 1958 - 1971 | 87 |
| The Bhutto and Zia years 1971 - 1988 | 88 |
| Intermittent Civilian Rule 1988-1999 | 92 |
| Return of Dictatorship 1999 - 2008..... | 94 |
| Return of the Civilian Rule 2008-onwards..... | 95 |
| Evolution of power and influence of domestic institutions..... | 98 |
| Military and the Inter Service Intelligence (ISI) | 98 |
| Political Parties..... | 102 |

| | |
|---|------------|
| Parliament..... | 103 |
| Judiciary | 105 |
| Conclusion..... | 107 |
| Chapter 4: Pakistan’s Foreign Policy | 110 |
| Phases and Key Players in Pakistan’s Foreign Policy Making | 110 |
| Phase I: Seeking Alliances 1947 - 1965 | 110 |
| Phase II: A period of short Interlude 1965 - 1978..... | 111 |
| Phase III: A Frontline State 1979 - 1988..... | 113 |
| Phase IV: Post-Cold War Adjustments in Pakistan’s Foreign Policy 1989-1999 | 115 |
| Phase V: Counter Terrorism 2000..... | 118 |
| Phase VI: Exploring Alternatives..... | 119 |
| Conclusion..... | 121 |
| Chapter 5: The Origins of an Alignment Strategy towards China 1950 - 2005 | 129 |
| In Search of Friends and Finance: 1947 - 1962..... | 129 |
| A Common Adversary 1963-1977 | 134 |
| Nuclear Ambitions and Sanctions 1979 - 1999 | 139 |
| Counterterrorism and the Balancing act 1999 - 2005..... | 141 |
| Conclusion..... | 142 |
| Chapter 6: Overview of Pakistan’s China Policy 2005 onwards..... | 145 |
| Overview of dynamics of Pakistan’s strengthening alignment towards China. | 145 |
| Chapter 7: Pakistan’s Economic and Trade Policy towards China 2005 onwards | 159 |
| Developments in Systemic and Sub-Systemic Economic and Trade Environment 2005 onwards..... | 160 |
| Intervening Variable : Strategic Culture: | 172 |
| Pakistan’s China Policy 2005 onwards: Strengthening Alignment..... | 179 |
| Conclusion..... | 189 |
| Chapter 8: Pakistan’s Defense and Security Cooperation with China 2005 onwards..... | 193 |
| Developments in Systemic /Sub-systemic External Strategic Environment 2005-onwards..... | 194 |
| Intervening Variable: Strategic Culture..... | 206 |
| Pakistan’s China Policy 2005-onwards: Strengthening Alignment | 212 |
| Conclusion..... | 222 |
| Chapter 9 : Social and Cultural relations between Pakistan and China 2005 onwards..... | 228 |
| Chapter 10: One Belt One Road and the China Pakistan Economic Corridor | 234 |
| Geopolitics of energy security in Asia-pacific | 234 |
| Pakistan and the One Belt One Road | 237 |
| Post 2015 Developments of CPEC..... | 243 |
| Internal challenges faced by CPEC | 246 |
| Fears of Chinese colonialization of Pakistan..... | 248 |

| | |
|---|------------|
| Corruption in CPEC projects..... | 251 |
| CPEC dragged in Inter-provincial disputes of Pakistan..... | 252 |
| Conclusion..... | 254 |
| Chapter 11: Domestic Debates in Pakistan about its China Policy..... | 259 |
| China as a reliable ally..... | 259 |
| Pakistani Leaders and their Praise for China..... | 263 |
| Why China is a favorite of Civilian and Military Leadership?..... | 265 |
| Criticism of CPEC but Not of China..... | 269 |
| CPEC as an East India Company..... | 270 |
| Conclusion..... | 273 |
| Developments post 2016..... | 276 |
| Chapter 12: Conclusion..... | 282 |
| What are the major features of this alignment?..... | 295 |
| What are the limits of this alignment?..... | 296 |
| Limitations and suggestions for further research..... | 297 |
| The future of Pakistan’s China Policy..... | 299 |
| List of Interviewees:..... | 301 |
| Appendix 1..... | 303 |
| Appendix 2: CPEC Highway..... | 304 |
| Appendix 3: Railway Route of CPEC..... | 305 |
| Bibliography..... | 306 |