The Ruist way of heaven and the Jesuit way to heaven: cosmogonic meditations by Fr. Angelo A. Zottoli SJ (Chao De Li 晁德蒞, 1826-1902)

De Caro, Antonio

Date of Award:
2019

General rights
Copyright and intellectual property rights for the publications made accessible in HKBU Scholars are retained by the authors and/or other copyright owners. In addition to the restrictions prescribed by the Copyright Ordinance of Hong Kong, all users and readers must also observe the following terms of use:

• Users may download and print one copy of any publication from HKBU Scholars for the purpose of private study or research
• Users cannot further distribute the material or use it for any profit-making activity or commercial gain
• To share publications in HKBU Scholars with others, users are welcome to freely distribute the permanent URL assigned to the publication
ABSTRACT

Fr. Angelo Andrea Zottoli S. J. (Chao De Li 晁德苑, 1826-1902), was an Italian Jesuit missionary who arrived in Zi-ka-wei (Xujiahui 徐家匯, Shanghai), on September 1848. He played a major role in the community of Zi-ka-wei as an educator and an erudite sinologist. This project aims to highlight his writings on creation *ex nihilo* (out of nothing) by God and his perspective on cosmogony since it had been a crucial and constant topic of his theological and philosophical writings. In fact, just one year after his arrival, in 1849 Zottoli started to work on theological texts on Roman Catholic cosmogony adopting, however, a very usual and common theological approach in accordance with the education of the Jesuits of his community. Subsequently, in 1879, he published his *Cursus*, a course in five volumes on Chinese literature for European missionaries, discussing also Confucian and neo-Confucian cosmogony. However, already in 1869, in his *Qu pi xun meng 取譬訓蒙*, he expressed his vision on Roman Catholic cosmogony adopting terms from Confucian cosmogony, like *hua cheng* 化成 to express the idea of creation *ex nihilo*. As a result, this project aims to reveal the creative approach of Zottoli on cosmogony and, at the same time, his role as a transmitter of the Jesuit spirituality in the late Qing dynasty China. It aims also to unfold the personal journey of Zottoli who had been deeply influenced by Chinese philosophy in his writings on cosmogony and creation.
# Table of Contents

## CHAPTER 1: INTRODUCTION

1.1. Background 1  
1.2. “Those who love their life lose it” (*John* 12:25, NRSVCE): Zottoli’s mission and his views on cosmogony 4  
  1.2.1 Zottoli’s mission as a *Via dolorosa* 4  
  1.2.2 Divergent views on cosmogony: Zottoli’s major challenge 5  
1.3 The aim of my dissertation and structure of the core chapters 8  
1.4. Methodology 11  
  1.4.1 Analysis of archival materials and sources 11  
  1.4.2 Cross-cultural hermeneutics 13  
    1.4.2.1 Doing (cross-cultural) philosophy: paideia παιδεία (education) and xiu shen 修身 (self-cultivation) 16  
1.5. The limits of my research and uncovered topics 20  
  1.5.1 A narrow focus on cosmogony 20  
  1.5.2 Selections and rendering of the texts 21  
  1.5.3 The cross-cultural dialogue with Qing dynasty Confucian scholars 21  
1.6. Literature review 23  
  1.6.1 Works by Zottoli 23  
  1.6.2. Works on Zottoli 28  
1.7. Conclusion 33

## CHAPTER 2: ANGELO ZOTTOLI’S MISSION

2.1. Introduction 34  
2.2. Fr. Angelo Andrea Zottoli SJ and his journey to China 35  
  2.2.1. Preliminary note on the sources 35  
  2.2.2. Angelo Zottoli’s biography 37  
  2.2.3. Two early manuscripts written in Italy and letters written during his stay in Shanghai 51  
  2.2.4. The Dedicatio: clues of Zottoli’s biography within the dedication of the *Cursus* 58  
2.3. Zi-ka-wei Jesuit mission: its origins and Angelo Zottoli’s role 62  
  2.3.1. The Jesuit mission in Zi-ka-wei (Xujiahui 徐家匯) 62  
  2.3.2. The role of the Italian missionaries in Zi-ka-wei with a focus on Angelo Zottoli 74
CHAPTER 3: ROMAN CATHOLIC COSMOGONY AND COSMOLOGY WITHIN ZOTTOLI’S EARLY MANUSCRIPT (1849 – 1852) 80

3.1. Introduction. 80
   3.1.1. My hermeneutical method and the context of the manuscript 82
   3.1.2. Dissertationes Theologicae’s preface and general structure 84

3.2. Thomas Aquinas on cosmogony 85
   3.2.1. The Writings on the Sentences of Peter Lombard 87
   3.2.2. The Summa Theologiae 92
   3.2.3. The Summa contra Gentiles 93

3.3. Tractatus De Deo Creatore (Treatise on God the Creator): Early cosmogonic meditations by Zottoli 95
   3.3.1. On the Angels 100
   3.3.2. De Mundo (On the World)
      3.3.2.1. Beginning of the Book of Genesis explained and established (first chapter) 101
      3.3.2.2. Moses’ cosmogony explained in detail (second chapter) 103
      3.3.2.3. Concerning Moses’ epoch (third chapter) 106
   3.3.3. On Human 108
   3.3.4. The role of the discussions on creation in Zi-ka-wei’s community: a concise note 109

3.4. Thomistic influences on Zottoli: a comparative perspective on cosmogony 111

3.5. Conclusion 114

CHAPTER 4: THE ENCOUNTER WITH CHINESE PHILOSOPHY: MEDITATIONS ON CHINESE COSMOGONY AND NEO-CONFUCIAN COSMOGONY IN THE CURSUS. 117

4.1. Introduction 117

4.2. The approach to Chinese philosophy: the originality of the Cursus 118

4.3. Cosmogonia Sinica: [Chinese cosmogony] an original description of Chinese cosmology and cosmogony. 124
   4.3.1. On Neo-Confucian cosmogony 126
      4.3.1.1. Jin si lu 《近思錄》 (Reflections on things at hand) by Zhu Xi 朱熹 (1130 – 1200) and the comment on Zhou Dunyi’s philosophy. 129
      4.3.1.2. Chen Chun 陳淳 (1159-1223) on neo-Confucian cosmogony terminology 132
      4.3.1.3. Contemporary scholars on neo-Confucian cosmogony 134
      4.3.1.4. Zhang Zai 張載 (1020 – 1077) and his interpretation of Confucian cosmogony 143
      4.3.1.5. The original text by Zottoli on neo-Confucian cosmogony and my interpretation 146
      4.3.1.6. The Jesuit understanding of taiji 太極: the example of François Noël (Wei Fanji 衛方濟, 1651 – 1729) 151
4.3.2. On Early Confucian cosmogony, including Zottoli’s original text 153
4.3.3. On the description of Heaven, Earth and Humans 158

4.4. Conclusion 160

CHAPTER 5. THE COMPLETED TRANSFORMATION OF THE COSMOS: THE CHINESE ROMAN CATHOLIC COSMOGONY BY ZOTTOLI 162

5.1. Introduction: Zottoli’s works in dialogue with Chinese culture and Jesuit spirituality 162
5.1.1. The Nanjing Catechism (1892) 164
5.1.2. Ascetic nomenclature (1877) 168
5.1.3. Uncertain clues on Zottoli’s philosophical positions in the Cursus (1879-1882) 168
5.1.4. The Latin-Chinese Dictionary (Dictionarium Latino-Sinicum, c.a. 1902) 173
5.1.5. Remarks on the other texts on Roman Catholic spirituality and Chinese philosophy 175

5.2. The Qu pi xun meng (取聼訓蒙), (Catechism illustrated with examples or Using Parables to Instruct the Ignorant, 1869-1870), a Chinese Roman Catholic cosmogony 176
5.2.1. The Introduction to the Qu pi xun meng 184
5.2.2. Rendering into English of selected parts of the fifth chapter of the Qu pi xun meng 193
5.2.3. Philosophical and terminological reflections on the fifth chapter of the Qu pi xun meng 197
5.2.3.1. On the term hua cheng (completed transformation) 197
5.2.3.2. Preservation of the cosmos and eternal creation (zaizao 再造) 221
5.2.3.3. God as the ruler (wang 王): a possible influence from Ricci’s Tianzhu Shiyi (天主實義) 227
5.2.4. Rendering into English of selected parts of the sixth chapter of the Qu pi xun meng 232
5.2.5. Philosophical and terminological reflections on the sixth chapter of the Qu pi xun meng 238
5.2.5.1 Tian Di 天地 (Heaven and Earth): angels inhabit Heaven while humans inhabit Earth 239
5.2.5.2. The role of humans in the cosmogony and the nature of evil 240
5.2.6. Conclusive remarks on the Qu pi xun meng 243
5.2.7. The context of Zi-ka-wei and the Qu pi xun meng: the works of the Figurists on neo-Confucianism and Zottoli’s innovation 244

5.3. Conclusion 246

CHAPTER 6 - CONCLUSION 249

6.1 A journey between Meng 蒙 (Ignorance) and Meng 夢 (Dream): the hermeneutic and philosophical elements behind Zottoli’s approach toward cosmogony 250
6.1.1. Meng 蒙 (Ignorance): Zottoli as an educator. 254
6.1.2 Meng 夢 (Dream): Zottoli as a transmitter. 256
6.2 My interpretation of Zottoli’s cosmogony 259
   6.2.1. Early ideas on cosmogony: the beginning of a philosophical journey 260
   6.2.2 The narration of Chinese cosmogony in the Cursus 261
   6.2.3. Qu pi xun meng 《取瞥謬》: the cosmogonic dream of Zottoli 262

6.3 Angelo Zottoli, the adventure of the Jesuits in China and cross-cultural hermeneutics: a vision beyond cosmogony 263
   6.3.1 Zottoli’s cross-cultural hermeneutics 266
   6.3.2 Was Zottoli a colonizer? 272
   6.3.3 A vision embedded in the community: a communion of souls 275

APPENDIX 280
Appendix Chapter 2 280
   1.1. Zottoli’s original letters in Italian 280
   1.2. Transcription and rendering into English of Zottoli’s letters 285
   1.3. Other information on Zottoli 302

Appendix Chapter 3 307
   2.1. Cosmogonia Mosaica toto lumine exhibetur [Moses’ cosmogony explained in detail]: article 3 rendered into English 307
   2.2. Original manuscript of the Cosmogonia Mosaica toto lumine exhibetur [Moses’ cosmogony explained in detail]: article 3 315
   2.3. Original manuscript of the De Mosaica epocha quatenus spectat genus humanum [Concerning Moses’ epoch that we claim is behold the humankind] 335
   2.4. Adversus Incredulos (Against the unbelievers): original manuscript 339
   2.5. Adversus pseudo-philosophos (Against the pseudo philosophers): original manuscript 342
   2.6. Theses theologicae: De Deo Creatore, original manuscript 348
   2.7. Dissertationes’ index, original manuscript 349

Appendix Chapter 4 350
      3.1.1. Preliminary Note 350
      3.1.2. Original text in Latin 351
      3.1.3. Rendering into English 359

Appendix Chapter 5 370
   4.1 Catechismi ad usum Vicariatus Nakinensi (Nanjing Catechism): Recipiendi Baptismi dialogus Ling xi wenda / Ling si wen-ta 《領洗問答》 [the dialogue for the reception of Baptism], rendering into English 370
   4.2. Ascetica Nomenclatio 398
4.2.1. Rendering of the Ascetica Nomenclatio into English 406
4.3. Qu pi xun meng《取譬訓蒙》, selections from Chapters 5 and 6: original text 413
4.4. Introduction to the Qu pi xun meng and selected parts from the initial chapter 419
4.5. Dictionarium Latino-Sinicum (Latin-Chinese Dictionary), original manuscript with selected terms 423

BIBLIOGRAPHY 430

1. Primary sources 430
   1.1 Available texts by Zottoli (Chronological order): 430
   1.2 Works on Zottoli 432

2. Secondary Literature 435
   2.1 European Philosophy and European Studies 435
   2.2 Jesuit Studies (excluding studies on Jesuits in China) 436
   2.3 Roman Catholic theology 437
   2.4 Chinese Philosophy and Chinese Studies 438
   2.5 History of Christianity in China (including works of Jesuit missionaries on Chinese philosophy and science) 443
   2.6 History of Zi-ka-wei and Shanghai 446
   2.7 Miscellanea 447