

DOCTORAL THESIS

Legal interpreters for ethnic minorities in Hong Kong: identities and cultural mediation

Gurung, Sangi

Date of Award:
2017

[Link to publication](#)

General rights

Copyright and intellectual property rights for the publications made accessible in HKBU Scholars are retained by the authors and/or other copyright owners. In addition to the restrictions prescribed by the Copyright Ordinance of Hong Kong, all users and readers must also observe the following terms of use:

- Users may download and print one copy of any publication from HKBU Scholars for the purpose of private study or research
- Users cannot further distribute the material or use it for any profit-making activity or commercial gain
- To share publications in HKBU Scholars with others, users are welcome to freely distribute the permanent URL assigned to the publication

Abstract

This study explores identity construction of ethnic minority (EM) language interpreters working for the Judiciary and law enforcement bodies in Hong Kong. It also examines how an act of incorporating cultural differences into interpreting emerges as an immanent aspect of EM identity. Interpreters' background and their close affiliation with a respective language and culture enables them to identify cultural differences in interpreting, thus such detection and potential mitigation through drawing attention and clarification, reinforces their EM identity in interpreting practice. Cultural mediation however, is determined by a number of elements intertwined within the field of practice: hierarchical positioning of interlocutors, existing system and interpreters' codes of practice, service providers' and interpreters' perception and attitudes, as well as interpreting competence and education. Therefore, identity construction of EM interpreters and their approaches towards cultural differences both remain a product of an on-going interaction between the mainstream legal system and existing mechanism in interpreting services on the one hand, and interpreters' insight on the other. Along the process of interpreting, interpreters' identities are constructed and reconstructed through negotiations between how they are perceived by others in terms of policies and daily practice, and how they see themselves as interpreters. While the study focuses on identities and cultural mitigation in interpreting, it provides the basis for identifying issues in interpreting in EM languages and further professionalising the interpreting services.

Acknowledgements

My utmost gratitude to the research participants without whose generosity in terms of time, information and commitment, this project would have been incomplete. Their contributions are profoundly valued. Sincere gratefulness to my supervisor and mentor Dr Ester S.M. Leung for inspiring, guiding, supporting and prioritising my work throughout the completion of this project and constantly prompting me to think from a broader perspective. Her valuable and meticulous input in the research is immensely appreciated. Thanks to my co-supervisor Dr Robert John Neather for his continuous support. I must also thank Professor Douglas Robinson for his stimulating classes on Western Translation Theories and Dr Kenneth Kong for forming a foundation on studying identities in communication. I extend my appreciation to Dr Gloria Lee for coordinating post-graduate seminars and creating a platform for invaluable exchanges of ideas among research students. My hearty thanks to all the research peers and staff members at the Centre for Translation for simply being there as a conglomerate of knowledge, sharing and assistance. I am grateful to Hong Kong Baptist University for making this study possible. I would also like to thank a fellow comrade Dr Dhiraj Gurung who runs a social networking site for raising awareness about the plight of EMs in Hong Kong that helped me locate a research participant. Finally, I express a very special thanks to a friend and well-wisher Walter Payne for his unwavering support in reading through the chapters of my thesis. On a personal front, I am indebted to my parents, family and friends for their relentless moral support. I am deeply grateful to Anup and Samar for putting up with my never-ending irregular schedules.

Table of Contents

<u>Chapter One – Background: Ethnic Minority (EM) interpreters</u>	<u>Pages</u>
1.1 Introduction: A study on EM interpreters	1
1.2 Demography and historical mapping: Who are EM groups in Hong Kong?	3
1.3 EM groups, social attitudes and employment issues	5
1.4 Interpreting work: current institutionalised practices and existing issues	
1.4.1 The demand for interpreting services	7
1.4.2 Recruitment	8
1.4.3 Training issues	10
1.4.4 Rare archives: questioning the status of court interpreting	12
1.4.5 Quality of interpreting drawing media attention	12
1.4.6 Issues with credentialing	13
1.5 Literature review on court interpreting	14
1.5.1 Avoiding pragmatics in court interpreting	16
1.5.2 Role of interpreters	17
1.5.3 Power asymmetry in the courtroom	18
1.5.4 Interpreting training and pedagogy	18
1.5.5 'Cultural turn' paradigm in Interpreting Studies (IS)	19
1.5.6 Cultural intervention	20
1.5.7 What do codes of practice say about cultural intervention?	22
1.6 Research questions	25
1.7 Purpose and contribution of the research	26
1.8 Scope of the study	27
1.9 Chapters outline	28
 <u>Chapter Two – Theoretical Framework</u>	 28
2.1 Preparing the groundwork for a theoretical framework	29
2.2 Identity	31
2.3 Ethnicity	34
2.4 Jenkins' internal-external dialectic of identifications	36
2.4.1 Similarity and difference	37
2.4.2 Internal and external definitions	37
2.4.3 Group identification and categorisation	38
2.4.4 Boundaries	39
2.4.5 Interplay of the three orders	39
2.4.6 Nominal and virtual identities	40
2.4.7 Jenkins' epistemological base	41
2.4.7.1 Ethnicity with a religious dimension: identity issues in Northern Ireland	41
2.4.7.2 Welsh identity based on languages	42
2.4.7.3 Danish identity and issues of assimilation	43
2.4.8 Internal-external dialectic of identification and interpreters' identities	44
2.5 Integrating Bourdieu's theoretical framework	46
2.5.1 Bourdieusian conceptual tools	47
2.5.2 How do these conceptual tools work in a theory of practice?	48
2.5.3 Application of Bourdieu's conceptual tools in	

Translation Studies (TS) and Interpreting Studies (IS)	48
2.5.4 Integrating Bourdieu's conceptual tools in the study of EM legal interpreters in Hong Kong	53
2.6 Contextual model of intercultural communication	55
2.7 An integration of the three different models	60
2.8 Summary	62
 <u>Chapter Three – Methodology</u>	 64
3.1 Social Networking	66
3.2 Ethnography	70
3.2.1 Participant observant: a practitioner and researcher	71
3.2.2 Interviews with interpreters	75
3.2.3 Interview with a service user/recipient	78
3.3 Semi-structured questionnaire for legal professionals	79
3.4 Semi-structured questionnaire for the service providers, or governmental or quasi-governmental departments	81
3.5 Data analyses	82
3.6 Limitations	83
3.7 Summary	85
 <u>Chapter Four: Identity construction based upon internal-external contention of identification within the current social context of interpreting practices in legal settings</u>	
4.1 The social context: the stigma of ethnic identity	88
4.2 Interpreters' identification with their interpreting profession	90
4.2.1 Ethnic identity as a valuable resource	91
4.2.2 Ethnic identity versus professional identity	93
4.2.3 Achieving professionalism through a professional body	95
4.2.4 Professionalising through professional development courses, interpreters' need and authorities' intervention	98
4.3 Role of Interpreters – different perspectives and systems in place	102
4.3.1 An individual service recipient's views: a story of endurance, gratitude and resentment	107
4.4 Existing mechanisms: contradictions and inconsistencies within the system	110
4.4.1 Issues with recruitment	111
4.4.2 Interpreters' perspectives on working with service providers: virtual and nominal identities	113
4.4.3 Arbitrary system of assigning interpreters – contrasting expectations	115
4.4.4 Last minute cancellations	116
4.4.5 Lack of coordination and policies in place	117
4.4.6 Discriminatory payment practice	119
4.5 Summary	120
 <u>Chapter Five - Anomalies observed in interpreting practice</u>	 121
5.1 What is code of ethics?	125
5.2 Judiciary's guidelines for engagement of part-time interpreters	128
5.3 Inconsistent compliances of the guidelines	130
5.3.1 Interacting with defendants or individuals service recipients	132
5.3.2 Usage of the third person singular	133
5.3.3 Linguistic shortcomings in interpreting	136

5.3.4	Simplified rendition of legal terminology	140
5.3.5	Lexical ambiguity	143
5.3.6	Incoherent and illogical utterances	145
5.3.7	Dealing with difficult defendants and other clients	152
5.3.8	Conflicts of interest	154
5.3.9	Outsourcing documents for translation – breach of an ethical code	155
5.4	Disciplinary action	156
5.5	Summary	158

Chapter Six – Cultural mitigation: an elusive idea?

6.1	Studies on cultural differences: cross-cultural or intercultural?	160
6.2	Cultural difference and ambiguity associated with it	162
6.3	Application of a contextual approach	166
6.4	Cultural mediation	167
6.4.1	Views of legal professionals	170
6.4.2	RAS's views as an institution	173
6.4.3	Cultural differences at work	173
6.4.3.1	Cultural items	173
6.4.3.2	Cultural beliefs, customs and practices	174
6.4.3.3	Address terms/kinship terms	179
6.4.3.4	Roundabout talking/ elaborate background information	181
6.4.3.5	Non-verbal cues or bodily gestures in communication	185
6.4.3.6	Idiomatic expressions and culturally loaded terms	187
6.5	Power structures impeding incorporation of cultural differences	189
6.6	Summary	189

Chapter Seven – Conclusion

Appendices

Appendix I	Interview details	205
Appendix II	Informed consent for participation in research interview	206
Appendix III	Themes/questions for interpreters and an individual service user	207
Appendix IV	List of interpreters interviewed	208
Appendix V	An extract from an interview with an interpreter	210
Appendix VI	List of cases observed	215
Appendix VII	Questionnaire for service providers/users	221
Appendix VIII	Questionnaire for legal professionals	224
Appendix IX	A sample of a questionnaire completed by a legal professional	227

List of References

Author's CV