

DOCTORAL THESIS

考律以求雅: 萬樹《詞律》研究

李日康

Date of Award:
2019

[Link to publication](#)

General rights

Copyright and intellectual property rights for the publications made accessible in HKBU Scholars are retained by the authors and/or other copyright owners. In addition to the restrictions prescribed by the Copyright Ordinance of Hong Kong, all users and readers must also observe the following terms of use:

- Users may download and print one copy of any publication from HKBU Scholars for the purpose of private study or research
- Users cannot further distribute the material or use it for any profit-making activity or commercial gain
- To share publications in HKBU Scholars with others, users are welcome to freely distribute the permanent URL assigned to the publication

提要

《詞律》二十卷，清初詞家萬樹（字紅友，又字花農，1630—1688）編撰，成書於康熙二十六年（1687），全書錄六百六十調，一千一百八十餘體，是清初錄調最豐，辨體最詳的詞譜著作。現時《詞律》的研究，就成書背景及撰作原因而言，學者大多以明清易代的政治變故及清初詞壇針對明代詞壇而作出的反響這兩大方面切入，而就《詞律》一書本身的內部情況而言，學者傾向借助萬樹《詞律》中的〈自敘〉及〈發凡〉發微，闡述其體例，批評其得失。以上現況反映《詞律》的研究已經開展，同時基於《詞律》與時代的密切關係，又再一次證明此書對清初詞壇的重要性。然而，以上外緣因素雖然適用於清初詞壇的普遍情況，卻缺乏對《詞律》的針對性分析，而《詞律》的內部分析則又過份倚賴萬樹本人在〈自敘〉及〈發凡〉的現身說法，忽視了書中例詞、旁注、萬樹評點的價值。

因此，本研究除緒論及結論，正文凡四章，分上、下篇，嘗試從外緣到內部，為《詞律》研究提供新說。第一章〈緒論〉將就研究動機、文獻回顧、方法論等作基本說明；第二章將重新檢討清初詞壇的尊體策略，析論破體、辨體及時流景貌，重估清初詞壇在尊體此命題下的角力關係，由此，為萬樹《詞律》在清初詞壇的定位提供說法，作為往後論述的基調；第三章則從先秦兩漢論律、論樂的思想傳統、宋代六次更訂樂制及大晟府影響下的詞人生態這三方面溯源，析論萬樹《詞律》將詞律設想為樂律，再藉由樂律之道通往尊體之道的根據，以此分析萬樹《詞律》由「紹述古音」轉出其獨特的「律呂之學」的思路；第四章則轉入《詞律》內部，嘗試於《詞律》的〈自敘〉及〈發凡〉之外，探索其內在理路，藉柳永及周邦彥、方千里、吳文英這兩組在《詞律》中特殊的現象，指出萬樹強調比勘互校，並將此提升至貫穿全書、組織全書的內

在理路，由此邁向其「至公大雅」的追求；第五章則借鑑文獻學及西方書籍史研究的觀點，反思詞譜類著作的物質形態，分析《詞律》如何有別於當時一般詞譜，同時兼顧了視覺閱讀及聲音演練兩方面以推動填詞實踐，既解決填詞的操作問題也克服審美的困難，由此，呼應編撰《詞律》以推尊詞體的目標；第六章為結論，除歸納本研究中有關《詞律》的發現，同時亦會就研究方法作出反思。

Abstract

20 volumes of *CiLu* (《詞律》), written and edited by early Qing Dynasty Ci scholar WanShu (萬樹, who also named Hungyou, and known as Huanong) are finished in the year of Kangxi 26 (1687). The whole volume collects 660 kinds of tune (詞調) and more than 1180 kinds of genre (詞體). This makes it the most abundant collection of tune and classification of genre in early Qing. Of studies of *CiLu* today, from the perspective of writing background and reason, scholars tend to intersect the object through lens of political change during Ming to Qing as well as of the pinpointed response of early Qing Ci literary circle towards Ming Ci literary circle. Moreover, with regard to content of *CiLu*, scholars tend to decipher the text by interpreting WanShu's self account and introduction, explaining its format and criticizing its good and bad. This shows that research effort towards *CiLu* has already begun, and, at the same time, has demonstrated its importance to Qing literary circle due to the fact that it has a very close relationship with the era. However, although those external factors raised here are suitable to explain the universal situation of early Qing Ci circle, a target-oriented analysis towards *CiLu* is absent. Those internal analysis based on content also overly rely on WanShu's self account and introduction yet omit the value of Ci examples, annotations and WanShu's comments.

Therefore, in this research, except the parts of introduction and conclusion, the body contains 4 chapters and is divided into former and latter part so as to provide a fresh angle and discourse upon the study of *CiLu* via an attempt of viewing it from the external to the internal. The first chapter—Introduction— provides a clean explanation upon the goals, literature review and methodology of the research; the

second chapter will review early Qing Ci poetry circle's canonization strategy (尊體策略) to clarify genre integration (破體), genre classification (辨體) and the spectacle of writing trend of the era. It also reevaluates the tension among literary parties upon the issue of canonization in early Ching circle so that a new discourse upon the literary status of WanShu's *CiLu* would be brought forth as the fundamental argument of the thesis. The third chapter will trace traditional influence of *CiLu*'s by reviewing music discussion in Pre-Qin and Han, six times official review of music systems in Song dynasty and Ci lyricists' inhabitation under the influence of Dashengfu (大晟府), and hence, it is analyzed that WanShu's *CiLu* alludes rules of Ci poetry writing to music theory. Then through the way of music theory, it paves the road to canonization of certain Ci poetry — this also demonstrates how WanShu's *CiLu* develops its own unique rules of music-lyrics theory (律呂之學) from purely inheriting ancient style (紹述古音). The forth chapter shifts to the internal textual studies of *CiLu*. Apart from *CiLu*'s self account and introduction, it tries to explore its inner logic(內在理路): by the unusual phenomenon of juxtaposing LiuYong and ChouBaoyan as well as comparing FangQianli and WuWenyin, it is noted that WanShu's emphasis on comparingly slow reading and parallel proofreading is the inner clue of netting the whole volume as well as the corner stone to his literary pursuit of being "supremely just and grandly noble" (至公大雅). The fifth chapter borrows angles of bibliography and the Cultural History Study of Book to reflect on the material form of Cipu (詞譜)writing, analysing how *CiLu* differentiates from other common Cipu during the period: it both masters the two facets of visual reading and vocal drill to advocate the practice of Ci poetry writing. This not only solves the problem of writing techniques but also conquers the difficulty of adopting different aesthetics norm. It, hence, echoes *CiLu*'s editing aims which are promotion and canonization of Ci. The sixth

chapter is conclusion which induces all the discoveries of this research as well as reflects on the methodology.

目錄

聲明	i
謝辭	ii
提要	iv
Abstract	vi
目錄	ix
第一章 緒論	1
第一節 研究動機	1
第二節 研究對象	2
第三節 研究回顧	4
第四節 研究方法及反思	15
第五節 章節概述	20

上編

第二章 極盛與愈衰：清初詞壇尊體策略的張力及《詞律》定位蠡測	23
第一節 問題的提出	23
第二節 極盛：破體論與辨體論的繁榮	26
第三節 愈衰：清初詞壇的時流暗湧	38
第四節 小結	49
第三章 紹述古音——萬樹《詞律》的思想史淵源及「律呂之學」的提出	51
第一節 問題的提出	51

第二節	先秦兩漢文獻中「律」與「樂」的文化意涵	53
第三節	宋代改樂與大晟樂制的影響	65
第四節	萬樹《詞律》「律呂之學」的提出	78
第五節	小結	92
下編		
第四章	至公大雅——《詞律》的內在理路並以柳永及周、方、吳為例	95
第一節	問題的提出	95
第二節	《詞律》中的柳永詞現象	104
第三節	周、方、吳三家及《詞律》的內在理路	125
第四節	小結	153
第五章	閱詞、讀詞、填詞——萬樹《詞律》的物質形態與閱讀方法	155
第一節	問題的提出	155
第二節	圖譜的物質形態	156
第三節	《詞律》的物質形態與閱讀方法	166
第四節	小結	181
第六章	結論	183
第一節	重探《詞律》的性質	183
第二節	方法論的反思	186
徵引書目		189
履歷		194