

## DOCTORAL THESIS

### Synthesising media, politics and foreign intervention: an examination into Malawi's media system transformation

Harris, Suzanne Temwa

*Date of Award:*  
2017

[Link to publication](#)

#### General rights

Copyright and intellectual property rights for the publications made accessible in HKBU Scholars are retained by the authors and/or other copyright owners. In addition to the restrictions prescribed by the Copyright Ordinance of Hong Kong, all users and readers must also observe the following terms of use:

- Users may download and print one copy of any publication from HKBU Scholars for the purpose of private study or research
- Users cannot further distribute the material or use it for any profit-making activity or commercial gain
- To share publications in HKBU Scholars with others, users are welcome to freely distribute the permanent URL assigned to the publication

## Abstract

The conventional method for studying media systems has been to analyse the relationship between media and politics, based on Hallin and Mancini's (2004) seminal research *Comparing Media Systems: Three Models of Media and Politics*. Their approach automatically places the nation-state as the key unit of analysis to understand why media systems are the way they are and why they change. Research that has advanced this endogenous method of analysis in countries outside of the Western, democratically advanced context, has brought to light the importance of including external factors in studying media systems. Building off this analytical direction, this thesis introduces three new external factors; foreign aid, the conditionalities attached to foreign aid, and the role of externally created Pan-African media policy agreements.

Using a case study of Malawi, a small aid-dependent country in Southeast Africa, this research interrogates these three factors to reveal that foreign aid is a coercive foreign policy tool that has been used for manipulating change and shaping the type of media Malawi has. Based on the country's recent transformation from its authoritarian populist<sup>1</sup> past towards the dominant liberal media model in 2012, this research also reassesses Hallin and Mancini's convergence thesis, which claimed that most countries are 'naturally' heading towards the dominant liberal media model.

Drawing on theoretical contributions made from the fields of international relations and international development, this thesis develops a critical international political economy approach to the theory of foreign intervention to challenge this claim. By including the structural and ideological power arrangements of the global economy this theoretical framework reinvigorates post-colonial thinking, as well as broadening our understanding of how power is exercised in order to capture existing international power imbalances that exogenously influence change.

---

<sup>1</sup> The term "authoritarian populist" will be used throughout this thesis as described by Reuben Makayiko Chirambo (2009) to describe the political and cultural make up of Malawi since the political leadership of President Kamuzu Banda, who was often described as a political populist.

Therefore, the general conclusions drawn from this thesis indicate that media systems analysis is best accomplished through detailed empirical case studies, which not only rely on historical insights, but synthesise the role that media, politics and foreign intervention play collectively, especially in the era of neoliberal capitalism. By moving beyond the parameters of the nation-state in this way, and examining what external forces that are extraterritorial to the nation-state, it is hoped that media systems researchers will engage more critically with factors that are opaque, and view variables such as foreign intervention as instrumental in future media system research.

Declaration .....	i
Abstract .....	ii
Acknowledgements .....	v

## Table of Contents

<b>Chapter 1</b> .....	<b>1</b>
New Directions in Media Systems Research .....	1
1.1 Beyond the Remit of “the West” .....	4
1.2 The Analytical Shift.....	8
1.3 Foreign Intervention: Definition, History and Structure.....	12
1.4 Liberalisation: Definition, History and Structure.....	15
1.5 Neoliberalism: Definition, History and Structure .....	16
1.6 The Outline of the Dissertation .....	20
<b>Chapter 2</b> .....	<b>23</b>
Malawi: A Historical Insight.....	23
2.1 Colonial Period: Colonial Intentions (1891-1964).....	26
2.2 Post-Colonial Era: The 30 Year Dictatorship.....	28
2.3 Multiparty Era: Promoting Democracy .....	31
2.4 From 2012 to date.....	36
<b>Chapter 3</b> .....	<b>41</b>
Media Systems Research in Transition .....	41
3.1 Studying Media Systems .....	41
3.2 Externalising Media Systems.....	47
3.3 Supranational Institutions and EU Regulation .....	50
<b>Chapter 4</b> .....	<b>58</b>
The Rise in International Development and NGOs.....	58
4.1 Development as Post-Development.....	59
4.2 Development as Imperialism .....	62
4.3 Development as Developmentality .....	64
<b>Chapter 5</b> .....	<b>69</b>
A Theoretical Shift.....	69
5.1 A Critical Change to the Political Economy of the Media.....	70
5.2 Theory of Foreign Intervention .....	75
5.3 The Theory of Foreign Aid .....	81
<b>Chapter 6</b> .....	<b>88</b>
Adopting a New Methodological Framework .....	88
6.1 Critical Discourse Analysis (CDA) .....	89
6.2 Semi-Structured Interviews.....	93
6.3 Data Analysis and Coding.....	96
6.4 Trustworthiness and Transferability .....	97

6.5 Ethical Considerations .....	98
<b>Chapter 7.....</b>	<b>99</b>
Identifying the Power Holders .....	99
7.1 Malawi “Should” Change.....	100
7.2 Ideological Imperative.....	108
<b>Chapter 8.....</b>	<b>115</b>
The Change Makers .....	115
8.1 “He Who Pays the Piper Calls the Tune” .....	115
8.2 “Most of the Aid has Conditionality” .....	121
8.3 Forced Liberalization .....	125
8.4 Neoliberalism Parallelism .....	129
8.5 Development Parallelism .....	133
Concluding thoughts.....	138
Towards a Critical International Political Economy Theory of Foreign Intervention...	141
<b>Chapter 9.....</b>	<b>146</b>
Changing the New Research Agenda.....	146
9.1 Contributions.....	151
9.2 Limitations .....	154
9.3 Future Research and New Directions .....	156
Bibliography .....	158
List of Appendices .....	197
CURRICULUM VITAE.....	202